EXHIBIT E TO ALLEN DECLARATION

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
2	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
3	000
4	DAVID MORSE,
5	Plaintiff,
6	vs. No. C12-5289 JSC
7 8 9	SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT (BART); and BART Deputy Police Chief DAN HARTWIG, sued in his official and individual capacities,
10	Defendants.
11	/
12	
13	
14	
15	<u>DEPOSITION OF BENSON H. FAIROW</u>
16	(Pages 1 to 81, inclusive)
17	
18	Taken before SANDRA M. LEE
19	CSR No. 9971
20	October 16, 2013
21	
22	
23	Aiken Welch Court Reporters One Kaiser Plaza, Suite 505
24	Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-1580/(877) 451-1580
25	Fax: (510) 451-3797 www.aikenwelch.com

3 of 29 sheets

.

- 1 A. I didn't.
- 2 Q. Did you meet with your attorney?
- 3 A. I did.
- 4 Q. For approximately how long?
- 5 A. Approximately an hour on Monday and
- $6\quad$ approximately 30 to 45 minutes prior to today.
- 7 Q. You understand today we're here because David
- 8 Morse has filed a lawsuit against BART and Dan Hartwig?
- 9 A. I do
- 10 Q. The basis for this lawsuit is Mr. Morse alleges
- 11 that he was arrested without probable cause on September
- 12 8th, 2011, and he also alleges that he was targeted for
- 13 arrest based on his journalistic endeavors.
- 14 Do you understand that?
- 15 A. I do.
- 16 Q. When did you first meet David Morse?
- 17 A. I don't know that we met. I saw him in a BART
- 18 board meeting.
- 19 Q. When approximately was that?
- A. To the best of my knowledge, it was sometime
- 21 after July the 3rd, 2012.
- Q. Do you remember what the subject of that
- 23 meeting was?
- A. I don't remember what the agenda items were.
- Q. Did you observe Mr. Morse after that meeting?
 - 7

- 1 A. I do not believe so.
- 2 Q. So prior to today, that was the only time you
- 3 saw Mr. Morse in person?
- 4 A. I had seen him at some protests, some of the No
- 5 Justice No BART protests. Which ones, I can't recall.
- ${f 6}$ I believe that's it. There may have been other times I
- 7 don't specifically recall.
- 8 Q. Approximately how many times did you see Mr.
- 9 Morse at a protest?
- A. Two, three.
- 11 Q. What were these protests about?
- A. Protests against -- well, there were kind of a
- 13 combination of protests. Initially they began as
- 14 protests against the officer involved in the shooting of
- 15 Charles Hill that occurred on the 3rd of July. Later
- on, it became -- Anonymous became involved, and they
- 17 became all BART protests. I don't recall which ones,
- 18 but sometimes they merged together and those would have
- 19 been the occasions.
- Q. These protests were approximately during the
- 21 summer and fall of 2011?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. When you observed Mr. Morse at these protests,
- 24 what was he doing?
- A. I don't recall. Sometimes in the crowd. That

1 would probably be the only time I would have seen him,

Page 6 to 9 of 81

- 2 because during the protest I wasn't physically there.
- 3 It would have been through close-circuit TV.
- Q. Did you have audio with that CCTV?
- 5 A. No.
- Q. Were you able to recognize that Mr. Morse was
- 7 carrying a photo camera?
- 8 A. I've seen him with a camera before.
 - MR. ALLEN: Can I interrupt for a second?
- 10 Go off the record.
- 11 (Discussion off the record.)
- 12 BY MR. SIEGEL:
- ${\tt Q}$. When you were at the BART board meeting in
- 14 which you observed Mr. Morse, did he speak at that
- 15 meeting?

9

- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. What do you recall him speaking about?
- 18 A. It was something about the -- I don't recall.
- 19 It was somehow related to the protest or the way things
- 20 were being handled at BART regarding the
- 21 officer-involved shooting. Something to that effect,
- 22 but I don't specifically recall.
- Q. Did Mr. Morse speak at an appropriate time on
- 24 the agenda?

25

- A. I would have to go back and look, but I believe
- 1 it was during public comment.
 - 2 Q. He wasn't shouting out; he was speaking when it
 - 3 was his turn?
 - 4 A. In turn. I'm sorry. I shouldn't speak at the
 - 5 same time. In turn.
 - 6 Q. At what point did you become aware Mr. Morse is
 - 7 a journalist?
 - 8 A. I believe at that time when I saw him at the
 - 9 board meeting.
 - 10 Q. What do you know about Mr. Morse's journalism?
 - 11 A. I believe he writes for Indybay on-line.
 - 12 That's about the extent of it.
 - 13 Q. Have you read any of his articles?
 - A. I have.
 - Q. Approximately how many?
 - 16 A. I don't recall. Any that had to do with the
 - 17 protest.

14

15

18

20

- Q. How long have you been with BART?
- 19 A. Since March 21st, 2011.
 - Q. You weren't here when Oscar Grant was killed?
- 21 A. No.
- Q. Where did you work previously?
 - A. The Oakland Police Department.
- Q. How long were you OPD?
- A. Since March of 1990.

5 of 29 sheets

14

- 1 protests.
- ${\tt Q}$. How would you characterize the tone of his
- 3 articles?

6

- 4 A. Generally negative towards the police.
- 5 Q. Do you feel that criticism was warranted?
 - MR. ALLEN: Objection; argumentative.
- 7 You can answer.
- 8 THE WITNESS: I don't generally engage in those
- 9 types of things. It's my job to allow them to happen.
- 10 BY MR. SIEGEL:
- 11 Q. To allow what to happen?
- 12 A. If somebody has an opinion they want to express
- 13 about the police negative or positive, that's their
- 14 right.
- 15 Q. How did you come across Mr. Morse's articles?
- 16 A. I looked them up on-line.
- 17 Q. Through a Google search, for example?
- 18 A. Initially perhaps. At some point, I bookmarked
- 19 Indybay.
- Q. When do you think you started following his
- 21 articles in that way?
- A. More likely than not, it would have been late
- 23 July, early August of 2011.
- Q. So in the context of these No Justice No BART
- 25 or Op BART protests?

- 15
- 1 A. Yes. But some of those had occurred before I
- 2 took over operations for BART. So early on, it wasn't
- 3 my area of responsibility to be worried about it.
- 5 what does that mean?
- ${\sf 6}$ ${\sf A}$. When I initially went to work for BART PD, I
- 7 was assigned to the professional standards and training
- $8\,$ section, which is Internal Affairs training, the admin
- 9 staff. That was in March of 2011. By -- I don't recall
- 10 the exact date -- I want to say late July or early
- 11 August 2011, the chief made a shuffle of the deputy
- 12 chiefs. I jumped into the operations seat, which Dan
- 13 Hartwig was prior to me. He went to support services.
- 14 And Jan Glenn-Davis went to professional standards and
- 15 training.
- 16 Q. And what are the duties of the operations
- 17 deputy chief?
- A. I have 24/7 responsibility for all the uniform
- 19 services in the department, responsible for security and
- $20\,\,$ safety in the BART system. I additionally have
- 21 responsibility for the detectives division investigating
- $22\,\,$ criminal charges that come as a result of what the
- $23\,$ uniformed personnel do. That's essentially it.
- Q. And as part of your duties, do you create
- 25 operations orders?

- A. I do or cause them to be created. I don't
- 2 always write them.
 - Q. How often do you write them yourself?
- A. Nowadays, I do very little writing. Early on,
- $5\,$ $\,$ I would adjust the ones that were given to me to get
- 6 them kind of where I wanted them, but everybody pretty
- 7 much knows how we want them now. I don't do much
- 8 writing now anymore.
 - Q. Did you write the operations order on September
- 10 8th, 2011?
- A. I was certainly involved in it. I don't know
- 12 that I actually wrote it. One of the lieutenants might
- 13 have. I was involved in approving it.
- Q. And do you recall who co-wrote the document?
- 15 A. I don't.
- Q. What would be your best guess who helped?
- A. It would probably be Lieutenant Steve Coontz,
- 18 who was lieutenant over the tactical team at the time.
 - Q. Even if you don't write it, the document, is it
- 20 issued under your name?
- 21 A. Yes.

19

22

25

2

5

8

12

17

18

- Q. That means you have ultimate responsibility for
- the document?
- 24 A. Yes.
 - Q. What was your role on September 8th, 2011?
 - 17

Page 14 to 17 of 81

- 1 A. I was the incident commander.
 - Q. Were you C2?
- A. I was and still am. That's a permanent call
- 4 sign for all of us.
 - Q. What were your duties as operations commander
- 6 that day?
- 7 A. I was the incident commander.
 - Q. I'm sorry. Incident commander.
- A. It was overall responsibility for the events
- 10 that day when it came to the planned protest.
- 11 Q. Where were you located?
 - A. At the OCC, which is operations something
- 13 central. I don't know what it stands for. We just call
- 14 it central. It's where the -- think of an airport with
- 15 a control tower. It's where the trains are all
- 16 controlled from.
 - Q. Where is that?
 - A. Lake Merritt station.
- 19 Q. How did you engage with the operations that
- 20 day -- I'm sorry -- with the tactical plan at the Powell
- 21 Street station?
- 22 A. My job as incident commander is to maintain a
- 23 situational awareness of what's going on with events
- $24\,\,$ such as this because they can be fluid. While we try to
- 25 plan for contingencies, we can't plan for them all. So

9

16

22

2

29

20

- provides a limited amount of information to me when I'm
 sitting there remotely in Oakland.
- Q. Is it fair to say when you wrote this report,
- 4 you were not necessarily relying on direct knowledge?
- 5 A. That's true.
- 6 Q. You were relying on what other people told you?
- 7 A. True.
- Q. I have caught up with my earlier question. I'd
- 9 like you to look at Exhibit 1, which has already been
- 10 introduced which your counsel has a copy of. From my
- 11 understanding of what BART has told me, this is the
- 12 tactical team and crowd control policy.
- 13 Do you recognize this policy?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to 459.7,
- 16 which is on the page numbered 411 by the policy number
- 17 or 19356 by the Bates stamp. It's entitled "The Media &
- 18 Public Information."
- 19 A. 459.7?
- Q. Yes.
- 21 A. Got it.
- Q. Would you please read the first two sentences
- 23 of the second paragraph of that section?
- A. "Those with a right to cover photograph
- 25 demonstrations are not limited to representatives of
 - 27
- 1 major newspapers, radio or television stations. Persons
- 2 who represent small newspapers or magazines,
- 3 free-lancers and other citizens are also entitled to
- 4 take notes or photographs."
- 5 Q. Is it fair to say that the second sentence of
- $\boldsymbol{6}$ $\,$ that paragraph covers non-bona fide members of the
- 7 press?
- 8 A. Absolutely.
- 9 Q. Whether you're bona fide or not, you have the
- 10 right to report on protests occurring on BART
- 11 facilities?
- 12 A. As long as you don't break the law, yes.
- 13 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to the fourth
- 14 paragraph of that same section. It states, "Officer
- 15 should recognize media credentials issued by police
- 16 agencies or the media representative's employer as valid
- 17 identification."
- 18 Does that refresh your recollection about what
- 19 proper credentials would be?
- 20 A. It does.
- 21 Q. So if the credentials are issued by the media
- $22\,$ organization, that's sufficient; is that correct?
- 23 A. Yes
- ${\tt Q.}$ Do you have any independent knowledge of how
- 25 David Morse might have blocked fare gates?

- A. Not specific, no.
- Q. Do you remember noticing on the close-circuit
 - TV David Morse was blocking fare gates?
- 4 A. Not specifically. I saw a large group
- 5 traveling in a circular motion. That was about it.
- 6 Q. Did Chief Rainey ask you to acquire video of
- 7 David Morse speaking at BART board of directors
- 8 meetings?
 - A. Not that I recall.
- 10 Q. Prior to September 8th, 2011, do you remember
- 11 having any conversation with any BART officer regarding
- 12 Dave Id or David Morse?
- 13 A. I don't have specific recollection, but I'm
- 14 certain that some conversations did occur.
- Q. Who did you speak with regarding Dave Id?
 - A. I don't have specific recollections. I can
- 17 tell you that we were aware because of the past
- demonstrations that where he showed up usually
- 19 Christopher Cantor did, too. We had an interest in
- 20 knowing when he arrived because he would arrive early.
- 21 It was a fair predictor where the protest would be.
 - Q. Who is Christopher Cantor?
- A. He was one of the people from No Justice No
- 24 BART that would frequently speak out in public or give
- press announcements, that type of thing. He was the
- - 1 visible face of No Justice No BART.
 - Q. Did you consider him to be a leader of this
 - 3 movement?
 - 4 A. Perhaps. I know from my experience with
 - 5 protests and these times that frequently there's a claim
 - 6 of no leadership, but what is often the case is there
 - 7 are certain individuals that will stand out. He could
 - 8 have been. I don't have independent knowledge of it,
 - 9 though.
 - 10 Q. Other than the fact Mr. Morse seemed to arrive
 - 11 around the same time as Mr. Cantor, did you have any
 - 12 other information that Mr. Morse was a part of this
 - 13 movement?

14

15

- A. No.
- Q. Did you have any knowledge that he should be
- 16 considered a dangerous person?
- 17 A. No.
 - Q. A threat to BART facilities?
- 19 A. No.
- ${\tt Q.}$ Was a scribe designated for the September 8th,
- 21 2011, protest?
- 22 A. I don't specifically recall. It was a new
- 23 thing for BART PD, so although I always wanted one, I
- 24 didn't always get one because of staffing needs.
- Q. What's the function of a scribe?

16

- 1 did this work, and if it didn't work well, what could we
- 2 do better next time. That's ideal. 3 Q. So what actually happened?
- 4 A. I don't believe there was an after-action
- 5 completed with this one for a couple of reasons. Again,
- 6 keep in mind I'm new to BART. They aren't used to
- 7 having maybe as in-depth an ops order as this. I'm also
- 8 introducing some maybe new ideas. So they weren't in
- 9 the mode of doing after-action plans yet. Also at this
- 10 time, we had back-to-back protests. I believe this was
- 11 the fifth, if not sixth, at this point. Kind of on a
- 12 weekly basis. We didn't have time. It didn't get done.
- 13 Q. Were you creating ops orders for each of these
- 14 protests?

Page 34 to 37 of 81

- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. How did you distribute the ops orders? If you
- 17 recall.
- 18 A. I don't do the distribution. I turn it in to
- 19 one of the admin staff, and it gets distributed to
- 20 personnel. I believe it goes to all personnel, but I
- 21 don't know that for a fact.
- 22 Q. When you say "personnel," what do you mean?
- 23 A. Police personnel. The department.
- 24 Q. Every officer in the department?
- 25 A. I believe so. I don't know that for a fact.

- 1 Q. Do you know if officers were given sufficient
- 2 time to review this document?
- 3 A. It depends when it's actually distributed, but
- 4 yes, I always try to make sure they have enough time to
- 5 review it. There's also lineups where it's discussed
- 6 with the command personnel there in charge.
- 7 Q. Who did you meet with in command staff to
- 8 prepare for September 8th, 2011?
- 9 A. I don't specifically recall. More likely than
- 10 not Lieutenant Steve Coontz; may have been John
- 11 Conneeley, another lieutenant; both commanders of the
- 12 tactical team.
- 13 Q. You didn't meet with Deputy Chief Hartwig?
- 14 A. I don't specifically recall, but I may have.
- 15 Q. Is there a regular command staff meeting?
- 16 A. Yes. Every Tuesday.
- 17 Q. Every Tuesday.
- 18 On the face of the ops orders we're looking at
- 19 here, it states date of issue 9/8/11.
- 20 Is that a reliable indicator of when this
- 21 document was issued?
- 22 A. I don't know.
- 23 Q. Is it possible it was issued before?
- 24 A. It is.
- 25 ${f Q}$. I'd like to direct your attention to the last

page of this document -- it's the second-to-the-last

10 of 29 sheets 36

- 2 page, page 17.
 - A. Okay.
- 4 Q. The second chart here is under the heading
- 5 "Criminal Codes Related to Protest Activities."
 - Why is that included here?
- 7 A. I include that in the operations order so
- 8 officers when faced with crime have some idea what it
- might be. It's an easy reference for them. It's
- 10 similar to a traffic officer carrying around an abridged
- version of the Vehicle Code. It's common statutes that 11
- 12 are used in those circumstances.
- 13 Q. Are you aware that the tactical team and crowd
- 14 control policy states that mass arrests should only be
- 15 conducted pursuant to Penal Code 409?
 - A. I'm not aware of that.
- 17 Q. I'd like to direct your attention back to
- 18 Exhibit 1, and the page I'm looking at is under the
- 19 title "Arrests," 459.4, and it's on BART 19354.
- 20 A. Bates?
- 21 Q. The Bates stamp is 19354. The smaller page
- 22 number is 409.
- 23 A. Okay.
- 24 Q. In the third paragraph here, one of the middle
- 25 sentences, it states, "the only proper basis for a

- multiple simultaneous arrest of all the individuals at a
- demonstration is failure to disperse (409 PC)."
- 3 Do you see that?
- 4 A. I do.

- Q. On September 8th, was a simultaneous --
- multiple simultaneous arrest conducted?
- 7 A. That is not my recall. I believe multiple 369i
- 8 arrests were made.
- 9 Q. Is it your contention they were not conducted
- 10 simultaneously?
- 11 A. The detention of the group was simultaneous,
- 12 but then one at a time they were identified as to who
- had actually violated the statute and taken into 13
- 14 custody. It's my understanding -- I wasn't personally
- 15 there -- I know it wasn't a riot.
- 16 Q. If there was a multiple simultaneous arrest,
- 17 that doesn't mean that each arrest ticket or arrest card
- 18 is written at the same exact time?
- 19 A. No. But by multiple simultaneous arrests, I
- 20 believe this infers that it's 409 PC, the riot, and just
- merely the presence, being there. What we're talking
- 22 about here in this situation was 369i, elements of the
- 23 events that each individual was, as far as I know,
- identified as having committed. The fact that they were
- all detained at the same time, taken into custody

9

14

16

19

11 of 29 sheets

38

- 1 following that, I don't think fits the multiple
- 2 simultaneous arrest statement that's made here regarding
- 3 409 PC.

6

- 4 Q. So are you distinguishing between a temporary
- 5 detention and an arrest?
 - A. Yeah.
- 7 Q. What's the definition of "an arrest"?
- 8 A. Taking someone into custody physically or
- 9 giving them a citation for a misdemeanor if they qualify
- 10 for committing an offense based on the elements of that
- 11 offense.
- 12 Q. How long can you be detained without being
- 13 arrested?
- 14 A. A reasonable amount of time.
- 15 Q. Where do you see 449 PC in this policy; is it
- 16 fair to say that it's not here?
- 17 A. I don't know.
- 18 Q. Would you consider yourself the author of the
- 19 operation orders?
- 20 A. I would consider myself the approver.
- 21 Q. How many meetings did you participate in to
- 22 plan for the September 8th protest?
- A. I don't recall. At that point, we had been
- 24 meeting fairly regularly just because the protests had
 - been occurring so often. We would discuss it during the
 - 39
- 1 command staff. It would be with our operations
 - counterparts within the BART system, those who patrol
- 3 the trains and the stations, that type of thing.
- 4 Q. Do you recall at one of those meetings a "Be On
- 5 the Look Out" document was distributed?
- 6 A. No.

25

2

- 7 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to -- I
- 8 thought we had it here -- Exhibit 4.
- 9 A. Got it.
- 10 Q. Do you recall this document?
- 11 A. I do.
- Q. What is it?
- A. It's pictures of Christopher Cantor and Mr.
- 14 Morse. At that point, we had identified Mr. Cantor. We
- didn't know Mr. Morse's actual name. He was identified
- 16 by his moniker, Dave Id.
- Q. Is this a BOLO?
- A. No. It's a document that was handed out to
- 19 officers who were out there that day. Again, as you
- 20 recall earlier, I mentioned that if Mr. Morse showed up,
- 21 it was highly likely that that's where the protest would
- 22 be, So actually if either one of them showed up. What
- 23 this was created for was to allow field personnel to
- 24 know what both of them looked like and to advise us when
- 25 they showed up so we knew whether we would have the

- 1 resources in the right place or not.
- Q. How is this distinguishable from a BOLO?
 - A. BOLOs usually have some kind of action
- 4 requested, either arrest, identify, missing people if

Page 38 to 41 of 81

40

- 5 (it's a missing person, a BOL for a missing person. I'm
- 6 sure there's a couple I'm missing. But this was solely
- 7 to provide field personnel with an idea what these two
- 3 individuals looked like.
 - Q. Did you use a mugshot of Christopher Cantor in
- 10 this B0L0?
- 11 A. I would be guessing, but it appears as though
- 12 the one on the left -- upper left-hand corner is a
- 13 mugshot. It could be a driver's license, though.
 - Q. Why was the PFN included?
- 15 A. Because he had been arrested before.
 - Q. How did that help to identify him?
- 17 A. I didn't need to identify him. He had already
- 18 been identified.
 - Q. I'm saying: This document was issued to help
- 20 people visually identify Cantor and Dave Id; is that
- 21 correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. So why is the PFN included?
- A. I don't have specific knowledge of why. I can
- 25 think of a variety of reasons, one being if we did come

39

- in contact with them and they were taken into custody
- $2\,$ again, it would speed the process. We wouldn't have to
- 3 do a record-check to know what his PFN is.
- 4 Q. So in certain ways this document is
- 5 anticipating the arrest of Cantor?
- ${\small \textbf{6}} \hspace{15mm} \textbf{MR. ALLEN: Objection. It's argumentative},$
- 7 calls for speculation.
- 8 THE WITNESS: No. Not at all.
- 9 BY MR. SIEGEL:
- Q. Is it fair to say this document stigmatizes
- 11 Cantor?
- MR. ALLEN: Objection; argumentative.
- 13 THE WITNESS: No. It's for police use only.
- 14 BY MR. SIEGEL:
- 15 Q. There aren't any specific instructions on how
- 16 to use this document on the document, are there?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. It doesn't say use this document to identify
- 19 these two people, does it?
 - A. No.
- Q. How often does BART create a BOLO, an official
- 22 B0L0?

20

24

- A. Once or twice a week.
 - Q. And how often -- let me take that back.
- Does BART create BOLOs for protests?

Aiken Welch Court Reporters Benson Fairow 10/16/2013

9

45

4:

- 1 A. Not unless someone is wanted.
- Q. What would you call this document?
- A. I don't know that I would give it a label. I
- 4 don't know.
- ${\tt Q}$. Have you ever created something like this
- 6 before?
- 7 A. Not that I recall.
- 8 Q. Since this document was created, have you
- 9 created another like it?
- 10 A. No. There hasn't been a need.
- 11 Q. What was the need for September 8th to create
- 12 this document?
- A. We knew that if either Mr. Cantor or Mr. Morse
- 14 appeared on a day when there was a protest scheduled to
- 15 occur that it was more likely than not that the protest
- 16 would occur where they showed up. So having early
- 17 intelligence that they were present was helpful in
- 18 determining where we were going to send resources. As I
- 19 recall, this particular day there was some confusion as
- 20 to whether they would actually be at Powell or another
- 21 station. It's difficult for us as a law enforcement
- 22 agency to mobilize enough resources to cover every
- 23 contingency. We try to cover them as best we can and
- 24 try to minimize surprises whenever possible. In this
- case, it was going to be to our advantage to know where
- case, it was going to be to our advantage to know where
- 1 either Mr. Cantor or Mr. Morse showed up because we
- 3 not play catchup by having to move to another station we

would be able to put our resources in that location and

- 4 weren't aware of.
- 5 Q. Did you work with Officer Dam in preparing this
- 6 document?
- 7 A. I don't know that I worked with him. I knew he
- 8 was preparing it.
- 9 Q. Did you order him to prepare it?
- 10 A. I may have.
- 11 ${\sf Q}$. If you had to do it over again, would you
- 12 prepare this document in the same manner?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Other than this document, did you highlight
- 15 David Morse in any other way in advance of the protest?
- 16 A. Not that I recall other than maybe at briefings
- 17 talking about if either one of them were seen, they need
- 18 to alert us as soon as they were seen.
- 19 Q. Were you hoping to arrest Mr. Morse?
- 20 A. Not necessarily. I was hoping the protest
- $21\,$ would be just that, a protest, that there wouldn't be
- 22 any law-breaking.
- Q. Were you hoping to learn his true name?
- A. I don't know that I gave that any consideration
- 25 at the time. He hadn't committed any criminal acts, so

- 1 I really wouldn't be interested in that.
- 2 Q. Who is Christopher Vogan?
 - A. That's one of our officers.
- 4 Q. What is his title?
- A. Just an officer.
 - Q. Do you remember working with him with regards
- 7 to the protest in question?
- 8 A. I may have.
 - Q. What role would he play in the protest?
- 10 A. He and another officer -- I don't have specific
- 11 recall to this protest. He and another officer at that
- 12 time had assignments that were undercover type of
- $13\,$ assignments, so I know I used them on occasion to do
- 14 undercover work. Basically surveillance.
- Q. Do you remember if any undercover officer was
- 16 used on September 8th?
- 17 A. I don't specifically recall, but I may have.
- 18 Q. Did you utilize any confidential informants
- 19 that day?
- A. I do not believe so.
- 21 Q. Would there be a record of such a thing?
- A. If -- if the information that a confidential
- 23 informant gave were to be used in that person's arrest,
- 24 I would assume there would be some kind of record. I
- 25 don't have any recall of confidential informants being
- There 20 don't have any recarr or contridencial informatics ber
- 43
- 1 used.
- 2 Q. During the No Justice No BART and Op BART
- 3 protests, you did utilize undercover officers?
- 4 MR. ALLEN: Objection; argumentative, lacks
- 5 foundation.
- 6 And if we're going outside of the scope of
- 7 September 8th, this is invading the public safety of the
- 8 BART patrons and the public safety obligations of the
- 9 BART Police Department as to how they monitor protests.
- 10 I'm going to instruct him not to answer short of a court
- 11 order in front of Judge Corley when I can discuss this
- The order the front of budge correy when I can discuss the
- 12 with her.
- 13 MR. SIEGEL: His testimony is that he may have
- 14 utilized such an officer.
- MR. ALLEN: No. He started to answer the
- 16 question before I could complete my objection, and now
- 17 I'm telling you we can't move to strike because it's
- 18 there, but I'm not going to let him answer any other
- 19 questions regarding this.
- 20 BY MR. SIEGEL:
 - Q. Is there a document that would state which
- 22 officers worked undercover on September 8th?
- A. Should be in the ops order.
 - Q. Can you review the ops order and point out that
- 25 section to me?

21

```
not been found as of right now. We will make due
 2
    diligence efforts to produce everything we said we
    would produce.
 4
            MR. SIEGEL: Thank you.
 5
            MR. ALLEN: You're welcome.
            (Whereupon, the deposition was concluded at
 7
            12:17 p.m.)
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
                                                        71
```

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I, SANDRA M. LEE, a Shorthand Reporter, State of California, do hereby certify:

That BENSON H. FAIROW, in the foregoing deposition named, was present and by me sworn as a witness in the above-entitled action at the time and place therein specified;

That said deposition was taken before me at said time and place, and was taken down in shorthand by me, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, and was thereafter transcribed into typewriting, and that the foregoing transcript constitutes a full, true and correct report of said deposition and of the proceedings that took place;

That before completion of the proceedings, review of the transcript was not requested.

 $\,$ IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunder subscribed my hand this 1st day of November, 2013.

24 SANDRA M. LEE, CSR NO. 997

SANDRA M. LEE, CSR NO. 9971 State of California